



## Educators for Excellence in Ethnic Studies

January 21, 2021

VIA EMAIL

Members of the State Board of Education  
Governor Gavin Newsom  
State Board of Education President Linda Darling-Hammond  
The Honorable Tony Thurmond  
[ethnicstudies@cde.ca.gov](mailto:ethnicstudies@cde.ca.gov)

Dear Members of the CA State Board of Education, SBE President Linda Darling-Hammond, Governor Gavin Newsom, and State Superintendent Tony Thurmond:

As educators, we support ethnic studies courses that confront racism, develop civic responsibility, and help students build the 21st century skills that they need to succeed in school, work, and life.

More than 1,000 educators, parents, and community members have submitted public comments asking you to remove all critical race theory pedagogy, references, and race-based pejoratives from the California Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum (ESMC).

Woven throughout the ESMC are at least 90 direct and indirect references to "critical race theory," which the ESMC states is a key theoretical framework and pedagogy for ethnic studies instruction (ESMC Chapter 3).

Critical race theory is **not** sound K-12 classroom pedagogy. Critical race theory teaches that students need to adopt a group identity based on their race, and then assigns a judgment or stereotype about the student based on that racial identity. This is discrimination.

Critical race theory also teaches that one race-based group is the oppressor of the other group, creating an oppositional relationship that leads to resentment and bullying. The ESMC is quite clear about this: learning about topics like "oppression" can make "traumas arise" and cause students to feel "vulnerability, uneasiness, sadness, guilt, helplessness, or discomfort" (ESMC Chapter 3, Lines 154-155, 283-285) The ESMC advises educators to embrace that by being attentive to "trauma informed" educational practices and having "school site counselors" available for further support when teaching ethnic studies (ESMC Chapter 3, Lines 156-157, 400-401).

It does not surprise us that lawsuits have been filed by families whose children have been harmed when critical race theory entered their schools. One such lawsuit was filed in December 2020 regarding [critical race theory education in high school](#) in Las Vegas, NV. This lawsuit asserts violations of a bi-racial student's constitutional rights under the 1st, 5th, and 14th amendments. In this case, critical race theory informed practices had teachers instructing students about which peers were oppressors and coercing them to affirm politicized and discriminatory views they did not hold.

The inclusion of critical race theory in the ESMC goes against California State Board of Education's obligation to not adopt instructional materials "that contain any matter reflecting adversely upon persons on the basis of race." (CA Education Code Section 51501). It also goes against our obligation as California teachers to "impress upon the minds of the pupils ...the promotion of harmonious relations" and not promote "discriminatory bias on the basis of race" in our classrooms. (CA Education Code Sections 233.5(a) and 51500).

As Stanford University Graduate School of Education Professor and Ethnic Studies researcher Thomas Dee states, "high quality ethnic studies model curricula...stress the considerable cultural assets and capacity of historically marginalized people to achieve well."

On behalf of CA educators and students, we appreciate your attention to this very important issue. Please see below for our detailed comments.

Sincerely,

Lori Meyers  
For Educators for Excellence in Ethnic Studies  
Educators4EES@gmail.com

Boris Law  
California Teacher

CC: Brooks Allen  
Joey Freeman

# Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum (ESMC) Comment

-- Draft Three --

(January 2021)

- Throughout these comments and requested revisions, **bold** text indicates additions and ~~strikethrough~~ indicates deletions.

## Critical Race Theory

Critical race theory is the theory that race “is a socially constructed concept that is used by white people to further their economic and political interests at the expense of people of colour [and that] racial inequality emerges from the social, economic, and legal differences that white people create between “races” to maintain elite white interests...giving rise to poverty and criminality in many minority communities.”<sup>1</sup>

## Our Request

We ask that all references to critical race theory, direct and indirect, be removed from the ESMC.

## Laws, Standards, and Guidelines

The following table contains laws, standards, and guidelines that relate to our request.

Laws, Standards, and Guidelines	Citation
<b>Discrimination Based on Religion/Race/Ethnicity: Not Permitted</b>	<b><u>US Constitution</u></b> Article I, Section 4: Free exercise and enjoyment of religion without discrimination or preference are guaranteed.  <b><u>Federal Civil Rights Act</u></b> 42 U.S.C. Section 2000d. No person in the United States shall, on the ground of race, color or national origin be subjected to discrimination under any program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance.  <b><u>California Constitution</u></b> Article I, Section 31(a) The State shall not discriminate against, or grant preferential treatment to,

<sup>1</sup> Curry, Tommy. “Critical Race Theory.” Essay. In *Britannica*. <https://www.britannica.com/topic/critical-race-theory>. Accessed January 21, 2021

	<p>any individual or group on the basis of race..., ethnicity, or national origin in the operation of... public education...[(f)...'State' shall include... school district...]</p> <p><b>California Education Code</b></p> <p>Section 220. No person shall be subjected to discrimination on the basis of ... nationality, race or ethnicity, religion...in any program or activity conducted by an educational institution that receives, or benefits from, state financial assistance...</p> <p>Section 51500. A teacher shall not give instruction and a school district shall not sponsor any activity that promotes a discriminatory bias on the basis of race or ethnicity, ...religion...nationality...</p>
<p><b>Instruction and Instructional Materials: Must Promote Harmonious Relations, Be Accurate, Be Objective, Be Suited to Students' Needs &amp; Not Reflect Adversely on Religion/Race/Ethnicity</b></p>	<p><b>California Education Code</b></p> <p>Section 233.5 (a) Each teacher shall endeavor to impress upon the minds of the pupils ...the promotion of harmonious relations...</p> <p>Section 60010(h) "Instructional materials" means all materials that are designed for use by pupils and their teachers as a learning resource.</p> <p>Section 51501. The state board and any governing board shall not adopt any ...instructional materials for use in the public schools that contain any matter reflecting adversely upon persons on the basis of race or ethnicity, ...religion...nationality...</p> <p>Section 60044. A governing board shall not adopt any instructional materials for use in the schools that, in its determination, contain (a) any matter reflecting adversely upon persons on the basis of race or ethnicity,...religion ...nationality...</p> <p>Section 60045. All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils."</p>
<p><b>The State Board of Education Approved Standards &amp; Guidelines</b></p>	<p><b>Social Content Standards</b> <i>(approved by the State Board of Education May 2013)</i></p> <p>"Intended to help end stereotyping in instructional materials by showing diverse people in positive roles contributing to society."</p> <p>"Instructional materials used by students in California public schools should never portray in an adverse or inappropriate way the groups referenced in the laws."</p>

“Adverse reflection. Descriptions, depictions, labels, or rejoinders that tend to demean, stereotype, or patronize minority groups are prohibited”

"The standards enable all students to become aware and accepting of religious diversity while being allowed to remain secure in any religious beliefs they may already have....without displaying bias toward or prejudice against any of those beliefs or religious beliefs in general."

"Adverse reflection. No religious belief or practice may be held up to ridicule and no religious group may be portrayed as inferior."

**Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines** (*approved by the State Board of Education July 2018*)

The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum must:

- “Include accurate information based on current and confirmed research”
- “Encourage cultural understanding of how different groups have struggled and worked together”
- "Be inclusive”

### Comments on Critical Race Theory in the ESMC Draft 3

The following table lists specific references to critical race theory in the ESMC Draft 3.

Chapter/ Appendix	Source	Request	Reasons
<p>Preface Line 44, Footnote 1</p> <p><b>Definition of Race</b></p>	<p>There are multiple definitions of race....In Ethnic Studies, 'race' is a (neo)colonial social construction. It is viewed as a 'master category' based upon a Eurocentric biological fallacy that is central to inequitable power relations in society. As a social and historical construct, the idea of race is primarily filtered through physical traits (phenotype), including pigmentation (skin color) and other physical features; where people's ancestral origins are from (pre colonial geographic ancestry); cultural traits; and sometimes economic class. Since race produces material impacts, it also produces racial consciousness and facilitates the process of racialization and racial projects, including both the oppositional projects of racism/colorism/anti-Blackness/anti-Indigenity and anti-racism/racial justice. The People of Color Power movements that emerged in the 1960s (Black Power, red Power, Brown Power, Yellow Power) are key examples of how race has also been embraced and leveraged in the resistance against racism; they are the movements that Ethnic Studies rose from. In the United States today, races very broadly break down as people of color (POC) and white people." - page 68. APA: Cuauhtin, R. T., Zavala, M, Sleeter, C. and Au, W. (eds) (2018) Rethinking Ethnic Studies (1st edition). Milwaukee, OR: Rethinking Schools.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p><del>There are multiple definitions of race. One is that race is the idea that the human species is divided into distinct groups on the basis of inherited physical and behavioral differences. Genetic studies in the late 20th century refuted the existence of biogenetically distinct races, and scholars now argue that "races" are cultural interventions [inventions] reflecting specific attitudes and beliefs that were imposed on different populations in the wake of western European conquests beginning in the 15th century. Race, Human, <i>Encyclopedia Britannica</i>, Audrey Smedley, July 28, 2020 <a href="https://www.britannica.com/topic/race-human">https://www.britannica.com/topic/race-human</a>, accessed 9/1/2020. In Ethnic Studies, 'race' is a (neo)colonial social construction. It is viewed as a 'master category' based upon a Eurocentric biological fallacy that is central to inequitable power relations in society. As a social and historical construct, the idea of race is primarily filtered through physical traits (phenotype), including pigmentation (skin color) and other physical features; where people's ancestral origins are from (pre colonial geographic ancestry); cultural traits; and sometimes economic class. Since race produces material impacts, it also produces racial consciousness and facilitates the process of racialization and racial projects, including both the oppositional projects of</del></p>	<p>1. "Master category"</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. This claim was first made by Omi and Winant in their book "Racial Formation" (3rd edition), not Tolteka Cuauhtin who asserts it in his book without attribution.</li> <li>b. Omi and Winant acknowledge that this claim parts with "both mainstream social science and left political theorizing about race." (page vii)</li> <li>c. It is based on Omi and Winant's new view that race is the primary lens to be used to explain what happens in our country, a critical race theory framing: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>"We advance what may seem an <i>audacious claim</i>. We assert that in the United States, race is a master category — a fundamental concept that has profoundly shaped, and continues to shape, the history, polity, economic structure, and culture of the United States." (page 106)</li> <li>"<i>This is a new claim for us....we are emphasizing its ubiquity: its presence and importance. We are noting that no other social conflict—not class, not sex/gender, not colonialism or imperialism—can ever be understood independently of it.</i>" (page viii)</li> </ul> </li> </ol>

	<p><a href="https://rethinkingschools.org/books/rethinking-ethnic-studies/">https://rethinkingschools.org/books/rethinking-ethnic-studies/</a></p>	<p>racism/colorism/anti-Blackness/anti-Indigeneity and anti-racism/racial justice. The People of Color Power movements that emerged in the 1960s (Black Power, red Power, Brown Power, Yellow Power) are key examples of how race has also been embraced and leveraged in the resistance against racism; they are the movements that Ethnic Studies rose from. In the United States today, races very broadly break down as people of color (POC) and white people." -- page 68. APA: Guauhtin, R. T., Zavala, M, Sleeter, C. and Au, W. (eds) (2018) Rethinking Ethnic Studies (1st edition). Milwaukee, OR: Rethinking Schools.  <a href="https://rethinkingschools.org/books/rethinking-ethnic-studies/">https://rethinkingschools.org/books/rethinking-ethnic-studies/</a></p>	<p>Requirements:</p> <p>The ESMC must "include accurate information based on current and confirmed research." (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. Stating that "races very broadly break down as people of color (POC) and white people" is Cuahtin's subjective opinion not supported by mainstream sociologists or social science scholars. As such, it is not based on current and confirmed research.</p> <p>In addition, this definition is based on a generalization needed in order to single out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>It promotes critical race theory.</p> <p>Requirement: Do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>3. Promotes the book co-edited by Tolteka Cuahtin, a private fee-based Ethnic Studies consultant whom the State Board of Education appointed as co-chair of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Advisory Committee (MCAC). SBE should determine whether its inclusion complies with State conflict of interest rules applicable to its appointees such as members of the State Board of Education and MCAC. For example, the California Political Reform Act bars SBE and MCAC members from participating in matters that</p>
--	--	--	--

			<p>“may foreseeably have a material effect on any financial interest.”</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Cuauhtin did not recuse himself when the MCAC agreed to recommend a model curriculum that cited his book.</li> <li>2. Cuauhtin is part of the Instructional Leadership Corps core teaching team and is featured in its promotional and educational videos.</li> <li>3. Cuauhtin’s book must be purchased to confirm and access its contents. (\$24.95)</li> </ol> <p>Requirements: CDE does not permit advertising in this curriculum. (“Lessons/resources should not contain any advertising or require any payment to use”. See CDE Second Field Review instructions (August 31, 2020))</p> <p>See also CA Ed Code 60048 and SBE Social Content Standards, 2013: “The standards prevent unfair exposure of any privately produced product.”</p>
Chapter 2 Line 125-128	Consult with other districts and higher education institutions that have implemented ethnic studies programs, to see if there are other models and resources that can be adapted to the local program.	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Consult with other districts and higher education institutions that have implemented ethnic studies programs, to see if there are other models and resources that can be adapted to the local program. <b>Ensure that models and resources are age and developmentally appropriate and do not promote critical race theory.</b></p>	<p>This addition ensures compliance with the following <b>requirements</b>:</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>Do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
Chapter 3 Line 83-87	For teachers who may feel especially concerned with teaching ethnic studies, leading ethnic studies scholars highly	Revise as follows and remove the source/footnote:	This paragraph, as explained by the source cited in the footnote, is discriminatory and promotes



	<p>recommend that they work through assignments like critical autobiography, critical storytelling, critical life history, or keeping a subjectivity journal, to begin the process of “constructively situating oneself in relationship to Ethnic Studies”.<sup>[1]</sup></p> <hr/> <p><sup>[1]</sup> Tintiangco-Cubales et al., "Toward an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy," pp. 118–120.</p>	<p>For teachers who may feel especially concerned with teaching ethnic studies, <b>professional development opportunities should be provided so that teachers are equipped to teach the course.</b><del>leading ethnic studies scholars highly recommend that they work through assignments like critical autobiography, critical storytelling, critical life history, or keeping a subjectivity journal, to begin the process of “constructively situating oneself in relationship to Ethnic Studies”.<sup>[1]</sup></del></p> <hr/> <p><del><sup>[1]</sup> Tintiangco-Cubales et al., "Toward an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy," pp. 118–120.</del></p>	<p>critical race theory. The text leading up to the cited portion, but omitted from the ESMC, ascribes “beliefs and deficits” to “White teachers” (as cited in the original source below) because of their skin color. It is because of this discriminatory assumption that White teachers are told to work through “critical” assignments. This is the definition of <a href="#">discrimination</a>. CA law prohibits discrimination.</p> <p>From Allyson Tintiangco-Cubales et al., "Toward an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy: Implications for K–12 Schools from the Research," <i>The Urban Review</i> 47, no. 1 (March 12, 2015): “White teachers often try to be colorblind and not see race, creating an imaginary world where neither the concept of race nor racism exists presently or in the past. These beliefs and deficits must be confronted, and doubly so for teachers of Ethnic Studies. Critical autobiography, critical storytelling, and critical life history can help White teachers examine connections between their individual lives and identities, and broader social and political contexts. Rather than assuming that Whites have no experience with race and racism, these activities assist White teachers in analyzing experiences they do have that contribute to their identity, beliefs, and position within the racial hierarchy.”</p> <p>Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Chapter 3 Line 279 Footnote 11</p>	<p>R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. <i>Rethinking Ethnic Studies</i> (Williston, VT: Rethinking Schools, 2019)</p>	<p>Remove this source.</p>	<p>See Preface. Line 44, Footnote 1</p> <p>Source promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p>

			<p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>Do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
Chapter 3 (line 395-396)	(Teachers and administrators) should familiarize themselves with current scholarly research around ethnic studies instruction, critical and culturally/community relevant and responsive pedagogies, critical race theory, and intersectionality, which are key theoretical frameworks and pedagogies that can be used in ethnic studies research and instruction	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>(Teachers and administrators) should familiarize themselves with current scholarly research around ethnic studies instruction, <del>critical and</del> culturally/community relevant and responsive pedagogies, <del>critical race theory</del>, and intersectionality, which are key theoretical frameworks and pedagogies that can be used in ethnic studies research and instruction</p>	<p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>Do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
Chapter 3 lines 402-406	However, it is strongly encouraged that both educators and administrators consult ethnic studies coordinators at the district level and county level, professional development offered by ethnic studies classroom teachers, county offices of education, faculty at Institutions of Higher Education, and other support providers.	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>However, it is strongly encouraged that both educators and administrators consult ethnic studies coordinators at the district level and county level, professional development offered by ethnic studies classroom teachers, county offices of education, faculty at Institutions of Higher Education, and other</p>	<p>This addition ensures that the ESMC is in compliance with the following <b>requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>

		support providers. <b>Ensure that the information gleaned is age and developmentally appropriate and does not promote critical race theory.</b>	Do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i>
Appendix A Lines 670-864  Sample Lesson 5: Introducing Dominant Narratives (in its entirety)	Sample Lesson 5: Introducing Dominant Narratives (in its entirety)  “Dominant narratives” are defined within the lesson on line 850: “Dominant narratives in the United States often target non-White ethnic groups who face oppression at the hands of the dominant social group.”	Review and revise the entire lesson to present the content in a balanced, non-discriminatory way.	“Dominant narratives,” is defined within the lesson on line 850 as “often target(ing) non-White ethnic groups who face oppression at the hands of the dominant (White) social group.” This is discriminatory per this definition and violates these requirements.  In addition, this is critical race theory which divides people into groups based solely on race, then ascribes “beliefs and deficits” to the groups because of their skin color. This is the definition of <a href="#">discrimination</a> . CA law prohibits discrimination.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i>
Appendix A Line 795-796  Lines 828-833	(Lines 795-796): Reclaim Philadelphia, “What is a Dominant Narrative?” by Kelly Morton – <a href="https://www.reclaimphiladelphia.org/blog/2019/2/11/what-is-a-dominant-narrative">https://www.reclaimphiladelphia.org/blog/2019/2/11/what-is-a-dominant-narrative</a>  (Lines 828-833): According to Kelly Morton, an activist from Philadelphia, “narratives around gender roles, body types, power, family, immigration, age, ability are all around us. They repeat to us who is dangerous, who is a hard worker, who is lazy, who is attractive, who deserves power. Even if we become aware of them and resist them, the world around us is still playing them on loop and holding us to those	Remove this paragraph and source.  Review and revise the lesson in its entirety to ensure that subjective material is presented as such, along with competing viewpoints to provide balance.  Review and revise the lesson to ensure that resources are “accurate, objective,” and from research-based authorities.	Source is a subjective blog misrepresented to students as accurate and objective. This does not meet the requirement for “accurate, objective” instructional material.  Source promotes critical race theory.  Removing this source ensures compliance with the following <b>requirements</b> :  The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)  All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)

	<p>narratives.”<sup>[1]</sup></p> <hr/> <p><sup>[1]</sup> Kelly Morton, “What Is a Dominant Narrative?” Reclaim Philadelphia, February 11, 2019, <a href="https://www.reclaimphiladelphia.org/blog/2019/2/11/what-is-a-dominant-narrative">https://www.reclaimphiladelphia.org/blog/2019/2/11/what-is-a-dominant-narrative</a>.</p>		<p>Do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Appendix A (lines 811-812)</p>	<p>Facing History and Ourselves, “Teaching with The 1619 Project in Ethnic Studies” by Kimberly Young – <a href="https://lanetwork.facinghistory.org/teaching-with-the-1619-project-in-ethnic-studies">https://lanetwork.facinghistory.org/teaching-with-the-1619-project-in-ethnic-studies</a></p>	<p>Remove this source.</p>	<p>IQC member Kimberly Young’s January 2020 article is about challenging the dominant narrative with the 1619 project, which was an initiative of New York Times Magazine. The 1619 project originally asserted that maintaining slavery was the main reason for the American Revolution, not liberty and equality.</p> <p>In the example lesson included in her article, Young asks students to discuss that “our founding ideals of liberty and equality were false when they were written.”</p> <p>However, the <a href="#">NYT retracted its protecting-slavery-was-primary claim</a> in March 2020, revising it to state that some but not all colonists had this motivation.</p> <p>Consequently, this source is now incorrect and should be removed, as the original claim promoted critical race theory and is repeated in Young’s article.</p> <p>Removing this source ensures compliance with the following <b>requirements</b>:</p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and</p>

			comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)  Do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Appendix C (Lines 1139-1141)	and a model for classifying the various ways in which race- and ethnic-based communities have resisted oppression (“Examining Transformational Resistance” by Solorzano and Bernal).	Delete the course outline or reference to “and a model for classifying the various ways in which race- and ethnic-based communities have resisted oppression (“Examining Transformational Resistance” by Solorzano and Bernal).”	Promotes critical race theory.  Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Appendix C (Line 1148)	Solorzano and Bernal’s model of four types of resistance, which include reactionary, self-defeating, conformist, and transformational resistance.	Delete the course outline or “Solorzano and Bernal’s model of four types of resistance, which include reactionary, self-defeating, conformist, and transformational resistance.”	Promotes critical race theory.  Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Appendix C (Line 1163)	in terms of Solorzano and Bernal’s model of resistance (see Unit 5)	Delete the course outline or reference to “in terms of Solorzano and Bernal’s model of resistance (see Unit 5)”	Source promotes critical race theory.  Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Appendix C (Line 1179-1180)	“in terms of Solorzano and Bernal’s model of resistance (see Unit 5)	Delete the course outline or reference to “in terms of Solorzano and Bernal’s model of resistance (see Unit 5)”	Source promotes critical race theory.  Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Appendix C	Students will learn about how Ethnic Studies is both “identity-based” and also a	Delete the course outline or reference to “critical theory of power”	Promotes critical race theory.

<p>(Line 1338-1339)</p>	<p>“critical theory of power” that interrogates multiple structures of hierarchy and inequality (“Ethnic Studies: Theorizing Multiculturalism, Diversity, and Power” by Marable) in order to understand the links between racism, sexism, homophobia and power.</p>		<p>Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Appendix C (Lines 1390-1391) (Line 1646-1653)</p>	<p>Ethnic Studies- Academic Language Development 2 (San Juan HS, Citrus Heights)</p> <p>(Lines 1390-1391) Students will be introduced to the concept critical race theory as they highlight and discuss the Morris reading in small groups.</p> <p>(Line 1646-1653) One of the main focuses of ethnic studies is translating historical lessons and critical race theory into direct action for social justice. In this section I will address the instructional methods used to develop the content knowledge and skills necessary for student empowerment and social action on a school and community level. While direct instruction and modeling are used to introduce new concepts (such as defining intersectionality and tracing Native American history in Sacramento in Unit 1, defining critical race theory, stereotypes and internalized and externalized oppression in Unit 2), learning will also take place through small and large group discussion.</p>	<p>Delete the course outline or references to critical race theory.</p>	<p>Lesson promotes critical race theory.</p> <p>Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Appendix C Throughout</p>	<p>All UC-Approved course outlines in Appendix C.</p>	<p>Remove all UC-Approved Course Outlines in Appendix C that promote critical race theory and/or do not meet UC-Approved</p>	<p>1.Promotes critical race theory.</p>

		<p>History/Social Science <a href="#">Course Criteria &amp; Guidance standards</a>, and <a href="#">Course Content Guidelines</a>, for History/Social Science courses.</p> <p>Examples of questions and assignments that promote critical race theory and/or do not meet these standards in the UC-Approved Course Outlines include:</p> <p>Line 980: What is the dominant narrative in the U.S. regarding ethnicity, race, class and gender? (See line edit regarding “dominant narratives” in the table “Comments on Critical Race Theory in the ESMC Draft 3”, Appendix A, Lines 670-864)</p> <p>Line 2503: Using excerpts from Freire’s Pedagogy of the Oppressed, students will study and identify contemporary issues of oppression or threats to identity in order to become advocates for their community. (See critical race theory-promoting quote from “Pedagogy of the Oppressed” in the following line edit, below.)</p> <p>Line 4483: In the mental and physical power struggle between the <i>oppressor and the oppressed</i>, who had the upper hand?</p>	<p>Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>2. No information or resources are provided in the course outlines to allow for differing perspectives and to ensure balanced instruction.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b> Examine the nature of evidence and the ways in which evidence is created, identified, compared and contrasted, curated, and accepted or rejected (non-honors courses) An understanding of the significance of time and place as variables in shaping culture, politics, and social arrangements. Offer multiple explanations of causality – social, political, economic, and environmental. Being aware of the contingent nature of our knowledge of the past, as it is shaped by variations in interpretation and differing perspectives. (honors courses) (<i>UC A-G <a href="#">Course Criteria &amp; Guidance standards</a>, as well as <a href="#">Course Content Guidelines</a></i>)</p>
Appendix C Throughout	All UC-Approved course outlines in Appendix C.	<p>Remove all UC-Approved Course Outlines in Appendix C that promote critical race theory and/or do not meet UC-Approved History/Social Science <a href="#">Course Criteria &amp; Guidance standards</a>, and <a href="#">Course Content Guidelines</a>, for History/Social Science courses.</p> <p>Examples of material on reading lists that promotes critical race theory and/or does not</p>	<p>1. Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p>Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>2. No information or resources are provided in the course outlines to allow for differing perspectives and to ensure balanced instruction.</p>

		<p>meet UC-Approved standards and content guidelines include:</p> <p>Line 2088 - course reading list includes Peggy McIntosh “Unpacking the Invisible Knapsack,” which states “white privilege (is) an invisible package of unearned assets that I can count on cashing in each day, but about which I was “meant” to remain oblivious... My schooling gave me no training in seeing myself as an oppressor...”</p> <p>Line 2267, 3421, 5224, 5257,7152, - course reading lists includes bell hooks - Decolonization. In another work, Bell Hooks writes “When liberal whites fail to understand how they can and/or do embody white-supremacist values and beliefs even though they may not embrace racism as prejudice or domination.”</p> <p>Line 2311, 2503, - course reading lists includes Paulo Freire, “Pedagogy of the Oppressed,” which states “The oppressors, who oppress, exploit, and rape by virtue of their power, cannot find in this power the strength to liberate either the oppressed or themselves.”</p> <p>Line 2000, 2310, 3825, 5411, 6515, 7765, - course reading lists includes Frantz Fanon, “Wretched of the Earth,” which states “...the United States of America became a monster, in which the taints, the sickness and the inhumanity of Europe have (since) grown to appalling dimensions.” In his other work, “Black Skin White Masks,” Frantz Fanon states that “the black man wants to be white, the white man slaves to reach a human level.”</p>	<p><b>Requirements:</b> Examine the nature of evidence and the ways in which evidence is created, identified, compared and contrasted, curated, and accepted or rejected (non-honors courses) An understanding of the significance of time and place as variables in shaping culture, politics, and social arrangements. Offer multiple explanations of causality – social, political, economic, and environmental. Being aware of the contingent nature of our knowledge of the past, as it is shaped by variations in interpretation and differing perspectives. (honors courses) (<a href="#">UC A-G Course Criteria &amp; Guidance standards</a>, as well as <a href="#">Course Content Guidelines</a>)</p>
--	--	---	---



		<p>Lines 1141, 1148, 1163, 1179 - Course reading lists include Solorzano and Bernal - “Examining Transformational Resistance through a Critical Race and LatCrit Theory Framework: Chicana and Chicano Students in an Urban Context”; (see multiple line edits related to Solorzano and Bernal’s promotion of critical race theory, above)</p> <p>Line 2001, 6296, Omi and Winant - “Racial Formations” (see multiple line edits related to Omi and Winant’s promotion of critical race theory in this document)</p>	
--	--	--	--

## Comments on Racial Identity and/or White as a Pejorative in the ESMC Draft 3

The following table lists specific references to racial stereotypes in the ESMC Draft 3.

Within the ESMC, the terms “white supremacy” and “white supremacist” are used incorrectly. They are used to connote that all racism and discrimination is perpetrated by white people. This is a violation of Federal and CA law and SBE rules: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students.

- A white supremacist is “A person who believes that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people.” ([OED/Lexico](#))
- White supremacy/white supremacism is “The belief that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people.” ([OED/Lexico](#))

Chapter/ Appendix	Content	Request	Reason
Chapter 1 lines 263-264	4. critique empire-building in history and its relationship to white supremacy, racism <sup>17</sup> and other forms of power and oppression	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>4. critique empire-building in history and its relationship to <b>white supremacists</b>. <del>white supremacy</del>, racism<sup>17</sup> and other forms of power and oppression</p> <p>Add the following footnote to define <i>white supremacists</i>:</p> <p><b>A person who believes that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary/Lexico)</b></p>	<p>The original content includes is a misuse of the term, and is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
Chapter 1 line 398-405	Even the concepts of “race” and “ethnicity” present challenges. What do they mean? How do they relate to each other? How were concepts of race, like “whiteness” and “blackness” constructed? How has our	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Even the concepts of “race” and “ethnicity” present challenges. What do they mean? How do they relate to each other? <del>How were concepts of race, like</del></p>	<p>Neither term -- “whiteness” and “blackness” -- is defined. ESMC Draft 1 stated that “whiteness [is the] antithesis of Blackness [and is] much more than a racial identity marker, it separates those that are privileged</p>

	<p>understanding of race and ethnicity changed over time? How are race and ethnicity as group identities reflected in public documents, such as the U.S. Census and most formal applications? How do these group identifiers impact social connection and division? Ethnic studies should help students address these and other fundamental issues that complicate intergroup communication and understanding.</p>	<p><del>“whiteness” and “blackness” constructed?</del> How has our understanding of race and ethnicity changed over time? How are race and ethnicity as group identities reflected in public documents, such as the U.S. Census and most formal applications? How do these group identifiers impact social connection and division? Ethnic studies should help students address these and other fundamental issues that complicate intergroup communication and understanding.</p>	<p>from those that are not.” Blackness is not defined.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Chapter 3 (Line 757-767)</p>	<p>They will learn about the interlocking systems of oppression and privilege that impact all people. Students will be exposed to a multitude of histories, perspectives, and cultures, with the goal of students being able to build critical analytical and intercultural communication skills; developing an understanding of geo-historical and cultural knowledge and contributions; fostering of humanism and collaboration across lines of difference; learning the value and strength in diversity; and developing a rigorous historical understanding of the development of racial and ethnic identities in the United States; and engaging in civic action, community service and/or community education to bring positive change that helps build a future society free of racism and other forms of bigotry associated with <i>white supremacy</i>, white nationalism, and institutional racism<sup>[1]</sup>.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p><del>They will learn about the interlocking systems of oppression and privilege that impact all people.</del> Students will be exposed to a multitude of histories, perspectives, and cultures, with the goal of students being able to build critical analytical and intercultural communication skills; developing an understanding of geo-historical and cultural knowledge and contributions; fostering of humanism and collaboration across lines of difference; learning the value and strength in diversity; and developing a rigorous historical understanding of the development of racial and ethnic identities in the United States; and engaging in civic action, community service and/or community education to bring positive change that helps build a future society free of racism and other forms of bigotry associated with <del>white supremacy</del>, <b>white</b></p>	<p>The original content includes is a misuse of the term, and is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See description of privilege, above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p>Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>

		<p><b>supremacists</b>, white nationalism, and institutional racism<sup>[1]</sup>.</p> <p>Add the following footnote to define <i>white supremacist</i>:</p> <p><b>A person who believes that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary/Lexico)</b></p>	
Chapter 3 lines 790-791	4. Critique empire-building in history and its relationship to white supremacy, racism <sup>17</sup> and other forms of power and oppression	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>4. Critique empire-building in history and its relationship to <b>white supremacists</b>; racism<sup>17</sup> and other forms of power and oppression</p> <p>Add the following footnote to define <i>white supremacist</i>:</p> <p><b>A person who believes that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary/Lexico)</b></p>	<p>The original content is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
Appendix A lines 150-151	4. Critique empire-building in history and its relationship to white supremacy, racism <sup>17</sup> and other forms of power and oppression	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>4. Critique empire-building in history and its relationship to <del>white supremacy</del> <b>white</b></p>	<p>The original content includes is a misuse of the term, and is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p>

		<p><del>supremacists, racism and other forms of power and oppression</del></p> <p>Add the following footnote to define <i>white supremacist</i>:</p> <p><b>A person who believes that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary/Lexico)</b></p>	<p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 893-894</p>	<p>2. What made this figure an important person in the movement for racial equality? How did they challenge systems of white supremacy?</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>2. What made this figure an important person in the movement for racial equality? <del>How did they challenge systems of white supremacy?</del></p>	<p>1. The original content is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>2. Like critical race theory, “systems of white supremacy” as a generalized descriptor of society today is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>

<p>Appendix A lines 897-898</p>	<p>3. What can we learn from this figure about how we should challenge white supremacy today?</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>3. What can we learn from this figure about how <b>to contribute to a broader social movement in a positive way we should challenge white supremacy today?</b></p>	<p>1. The original content is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>2. Like critical race theory, “white supremacy” as a generalized descriptor of society today is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 1145-1146</p>	<p>2. What made this figure an important person in the movement for racial equality? How did they challenge systems of white supremacy?</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>2. What made this figure an important person in the movement for racial equality? <del>How did they challenge systems of white supremacy?</del></p>	<p>1. The original content is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>

			<p>2. Like critical race theory, “systems of white supremacy” as a generalized descriptor of society today is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 1149-1150</p>	<p>3. What can we learn from this figure about how we should challenge white supremacy today?</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>3. What can we learn from this figure about how <b>to contribute to a broader social movement in a positive way we should challenge white supremacy today?</b></p>	<p>1. The original content is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>2. Like critical race theory, “white supremacy” as a generalized descriptor of society today is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and</p>

			suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)
Appendix A lines 3189-3190	The image of the transcontinental railroads meeting at Promontory Point on May 10, 1869, with no Chinese workers exemplifies the white supremacy view of US history.	Revise as follows:  The image of the transcontinental railroads meeting at Promontory Point on May 10, 1869, with no Chinese workers exemplifies <b>how important contributions of Chinese workers were overlooked and ignored at that time</b> <del>the white supremacy view of US history.</del>	1. The original content is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.  See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.  Promotes critical race theory.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )  2. No source or authority is provided to define or support the assertion of “the white supremacy view of US history.”  <b>Requirements:</b>  All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)  SBE’s ESMC Guidelines require that this curriculum “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.”
Appendix A lines 6469-6470	2. What made this figure an important person in the movement for racial equality? How did they challenge systems of white supremacy?	Revise as follows:  2. What made this figure an important person in the movement for racial equality? <del>How did they challenge systems of white supremacy?</del>	1. The original content is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.  See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.  Promotes critical race theory.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and</i>



			<p><i>California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i></p> <p>2. Like critical race theory, “systems of white supremacy” as a generalized descriptor of society today is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based..</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
Appendix A lines 6473-6474	3. What can we learn from this figure about how we should challenge white supremacy today?	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>3. What can we learn from this figure about how <b>to contribute to a broader social movement in a positive way we should challenge white supremacy</b> today?</p>	<p>1. The original content is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>2. Like critical race theory, “white supremacy” as a generalized descriptor of society today is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p>

			All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)
Appendix A lines 6583-6584	2. What made this figure an important person in the movement for racial equality? How did they challenge systems of white supremacy?	Revise as follows:  2. What made this figure an important person in the movement for racial equality? <del>How did they challenge systems of white supremacy?</del>	1. The original content is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.  See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.  Promotes critical race theory.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )  2. Like critical race theory, “systems of white supremacy” as a generalized descriptor of society today is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based..  <b>Requirements:</b>  The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)  All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)
Appendix A lines 6587-6588	3. What can we learn from this figure about how we should challenge white supremacy today?	Revise as follows:  3. What can we learn from this figure about how <b>to contribute to a broader social movement in a positive way we should challenge white supremacy today?</b>	1.The original content is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.  See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.

			<p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>2. Like critical race theory, “white supremacy” as a generalized descriptor of society today is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 8369-8371</p>	<p>Wade Michael Page is reported to have been affiliated with white supremacist and hate groups and was on the watchlist of organizations that track hate crimes like the Southern Poverty Law Center.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Add the following footnote to define <i>white supremacist</i>:</p> <p><b>A person who believes that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary/Lexico)</b></p>	<p>Because this term is used is this curriculum synonymously with and incorrectly to denote “racist” and “discrimination/discriminatory,” it necessitates a definition to ensure that students understand its meaning.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b> The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>

<p>Appendix A lines 8561-8562</p>	<p>Wade Michael Page, a white supremacist, walks in and opened fire during services at a Sikh gurdwara in Oak Creek, Wisconsin, killing six and wounding four.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Add the following footnote to define <i>white supremacist</i>:</p> <p><b>A person who believes that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary/Lexico)</b></p>	<p>Because this term is used in this curriculum synonymously with and incorrectly to denote “racist” and “discrimination/discriminatory,” it necessitates a definition to ensure that students understand its meaning.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b> The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 8626-8628</p>	<p>In the fall of 2012, a white supremacist opened fire in a Sikh temple, known as a Gurdwara, and killed seven innocent people.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Add the following footnote to define <i>white supremacist</i>:</p> <p><b>A person who believes that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary/Lexico)</b></p>	<p>Because this term is used in this curriculum synonymously with and incorrectly to denote “racist” and “discrimination/discriminatory,” it necessitates a definition to ensure that students understand its meaning.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b> The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 8776-8777</p>	<p>As we all know, on Sunday, August 5, 2012, a white supremacist fueled by hatred walked into our local Gurdwara with a loaded gun.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Add the following footnote to define <i>white supremacist</i>:</p>	<p>Because this term is used in this curriculum synonymously with and incorrectly, it necessitates a definition to ensure that students understand its meaning.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p>

		<p><b>A person who believes that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary/Lexico)</b></p>	<p><b>Requirements:</b> The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix C (Lines 246-247)</p>	<p>Analyze the concept of white supremacy (including institutional racism, racial hierarchy, and oppression).</p>	<p>Remove the course outline or delete this sentence.</p>	<p>1. The original content is a race-based generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, in violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>2. Like critical race theory, “white supremacy” as a generalized descriptor of society today is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>SBE’s ESMC Guidelines require that this curriculum “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.”</p> <p>Like critical race theory, “systems of white supremacy” is a theory and, as such, is not fact-based. Asserting it as fact as is done in this passage misleads students into believing it accurately describes society today.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p>

			All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)
Appendix C (Line 3313)	Elijah Muhammad and the 'white devil'	<p>Revise as follows and add footnote after "white 'blue-eyed devil'":</p> <p>Elijah Muhammad and the <b>white 'blue-eyed devil'</b></p> <p><b>Footnote: Elijah Muhammed called for the establishment of a separate nation for black Americans and the adoption of a religion based on the worship of Allah and on the belief that blacks are his chosen people. "Blue-eyed devils" was part of his anti-white rhetoric. (<a href="#">Britannica</a>)</b></p>	<p>The original content is incorrect. In addition, it needs context and clarification so that it does not mislead and stereotype.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>The ESMC must "include accurate information based on current and confirmed research." (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>

## Comments on “Institutional Racism” and “Systemic Racism” in the ESMC

The following table lists specific occurrences of “systemic racism,” “institutionalized racism,” and “institutional racism” in the ESMC Draft 3.

The ESMC does not differentiate between “institutional racism” and “systemic racism.” It uses these terms interchangeably, and defines them as “the systemic normalization or legalization of racism and discrimination. This often emerges via the unequal and inequitable distribution of resources, power, and opportunity. Institutional racism is also referred to as systemic and/or structural racism” (Chapter 3, Line 767, Footnote 13).

Chapter/ Appendix	Source	Request	Reason
Chapter 1 Lines 269, 279, 280 (footnote 25), 289, 409	“post systemic-racism” “systemic racism”	Confirm whether these assertions are widely accepted by respected scholars based on objective information and data. If not, remove these terms or provide additional theories so the curriculum is balanced and without bias.	Like critical race theory, “systemic racism” is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based.  <b>Requirements:</b>  The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)  All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)
Chapter 1 Line 344	The inequitable institutional treatment of certain racial and ethnic groups is sometimes referred to as systemic racism.	Confirm whether these assertions are widely accepted by respected scholars based on objective information and data. If not, remove these terms or provide additional theories so the curriculum is balanced and without bias.	Like critical race theory, “systemic racism” is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based.  <b>Requirements:</b>  The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)  All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)

<p>Chapter 3 Line 767 Footnote 13</p>	<p>Institutional racism: the systemic normalization or legalization of racism and discrimination. This often emerges via the unequal and inequitable distribution of resources, power, and opportunity. Institutional racism is also referred to as systemic and/or structural racism.</p>	<p>Confirm whether these assertions are widely accepted by respected scholars based on objective information and data. If not, remove these terms or provide additional theories so the curriculum is balanced and without bias.</p>	<p>Like critical race theory, “institutional racism,” “systemic racism,” and “structural racism” are theoretical and, as such, are not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix A Line 156, 175, 176, 207, 547, 6460, 662, 10547, 10662</p>	<p>Post systemic-racism Systemic discrimination Systemic racism</p>	<p>Confirm whether these assertions are widely accepted by respected scholars based on objective information and data. If not remove these terms or provide additional theories so the curriculum is balanced and without bias.</p>	<p>Like critical race theory, “systemic racism” and “systemic discrimination” are theoretical theoretical and, as such, are not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix A, Line 6460</p>	<p>Key Terms and Concepts: social movement, institutional racism</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Key Terms and Concepts: social movement, <del>institutional racism</del></p>	<p>The term “institutional racism” doesn’t appear in this lesson.</p>
<p>Appendix A Line 660-663</p>	<p>Implicit bias against Asian Americans as docile, passive, or too small of a community to care about by political</p>	<p>Confirm whether these assertions are widely accepted by respected</p>	<p>Like critical race theory, “systemic racism” and “systemic discrimination” are</p>



	<p>leaders and as demonstrated by Col. Kim’s story, by US military leaders, must be discussed to show how racism and discrimination is systemic.</p>	<p>scholars based on objective information and data.</p> <p>If not, remove these terms or provide additional theories so the curriculum is balanced and without bias.</p>	<p>theoretical and, as such, are not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix A Lines 902-905</p>	<p>Discuss how racism and discrimination against Asian Americans is systemic. For example, discuss implicit bias against Asian Americans as docile, passive, or too small of a community to care about by political leaders or documented by historians</p>	<p>Confirm whether these assertions are widely accepted by respected scholars based on objective information and data.</p> <p>If not, remove these terms or provide additional theories so the curriculum is balanced and without bias.</p>	<p>Like critical race theory, “systemic racism” and “systemic discrimination” are theoretical and, as such, are not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix C, Line 246</p> <p>Line 246: Ethnic Studies (Los Angeles Unified)</p> <p>Line 2214: Introduction to Ethnic Studies (Salinas Union)</p>	<p>Institutional racism</p>	<p>Confirm whether these assertions are widely accepted by respected scholars based on objective information and data.</p> <p>If not, remove these terms or provide additional theories so the curriculum is balanced and without bias.</p>	<p>Like critical race theory, “institutional racism” is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and</p>

		If the course outline cannot be revised, then delete the course outline.	suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)
Appendix C, Line 6035-6036	...the chapter "Systemic Racism: A Comprehensive Perspective" from Joe Feagin's Racist America	Remove this source.  If the course outline cannot be revised, then delete the course outline.	Like critical race theory, "institutional racism" is theoretical and, as such, is not fact and research-based.  <b>Requirements:</b>  The ESMC must "include accurate information based on current and confirmed research." (SBE ESMC Guidelines)  All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)

## Comments on Books/Journal Articles that Promote Critical Race Theory and/or Use Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative

The following table lists books and journal articles cited in the ESMC that promote critical race theory and/or use racial identity/White as a pejorative.

Chapter/ Appendix	Content	Request	Reason
<p>Preface Line 44 Footnote 1</p>	<p>Cuauhtin, R. T., Zavala, M, Sleeter, C. and Au, W. (eds) (2018) Rethinking Ethnic Studies (1st edition). Milwaukee, OR: Rethinking Schools. <a href="https://rethinkingschools.org/books/rethinking-ethnic-studies/">https://rethinkingschools.org/books/rethinking-ethnic-studies/</a></p>	<p>Delete source</p>	<p>1. Source(s) promote critical race theory.</p> <p>As one example, in the chapter “Matrix of Social Identity,” Cuauhtin provides a classroom handout that, among other things, asserts that “White Supremacy” is a system of oppression with Whites the dominant/privileged group and People of Color the oppressed.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>2. Promotes the book co-edited by Tolteka Cuauhtin, a private fee-based Ethnic Studies consultant whom the State Board of Education appointed as co-chair of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Advisory Committee (MCAC). SBE should determine whether its inclusion complies with State conflict of interest rules applicable to its appointees such as members of the State Board of Education and MCAC. For example, the California Political Reform Act bars SBE and MCAC members from participating in matters that “may foreseeably have a material effect on any financial interest.”</p> <p>Cuauhtin did not recuse himself when the MCAC agreed to recommend a model curriculum that cited his book.</p>

			<p>Cuauhtin is part of the Instructional Leadership Corps core teaching team and is featured in its promotional and educational videos.</p> <p>Cuauhtin’s book must be purchased to confirm and access its contents. (\$24.95)</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b> CDE does not permit advertising in this curriculum. (“Lessons/resources should not contain any advertising or require any payment to use”. See CDE Second Field Review instructions (August 31, 2020)</p> <p>See also CA Ed Code 60048 and SBE Social Content Standards, 2013: “The standards prevent unfair exposure of any privately produced product.”</p>
<p>Chapter 1 Lines 208 Footnote 7</p>	<p>Sleeter, C. and Zavala, M., <i>Transformative Ethnic Studies in Schools</i> (New York: Teachers College Press, 2020).</p>		<p>Christine Sleeter is a private, fee-based Ethnic Studies consultant.</p> <p>In September 2020, Sleeter asked the IQC to include her article and two new books in the ESMC:</p> <p>“Transformative Ethnic Studies in Schools.” (See #38, Sleeter request, in CDE’s November 2020 Table of Submitted Line Edits (Attachment C in IQC agenda packet). This book costs \$90 (hardcover).</p> <p>Teaching Works “that describes a curriculum planning framework ...and a book that elaborates on the framework and offers examples” citing Sleeter’s new book “Unstandardizing Curriculum: Multicultural teaching in the standards-based classroom.” (See #214, Sleeter request, in CDE’s</p>

			<p>November 2020 Table of Submitted Line Edits (Attachment C in IQC agenda packet) This book costs \$75.48 (hardcover).</p> <p>Both books must be purchased in order to have access to the material.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b> CDE does not permit advertising in this curriculum. (“Lessons/resources should not contain any advertising or require any payment to use”. See CDE Second Field Review instructions (August 31, 2020)</p> <p>See also CA Ed Code 60048 and SBE Social Content Standards, 2013: “The standards prevent unfair exposure of any privately produced product.”</p>
<p>Chapter 1, Lines 247-249 (Footnote 16)</p>	<p>Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. <i>Rethinking Ethnic Studies</i>. Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018.</p>	<p>Remove footnote and related content or replace the source with one that does not promote critical race theory:</p> <p>Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. <i>Rethinking Ethnic Studies</i>. Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018.</p>	<p>See reasons above (Preface, Line 44, Footnote 1)</p>
<p>Chapter 1, Lines 267-271 (Footnote 23)</p>	<p>Eunice Ho, UCLA Teacher Education Program Ethnic Studies Cohort, Class of 2019, summarizing the work of R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, “The Ethnic Studies Framework: A Holistic Overview,” 72-75, in Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne</p>	<p>Remove footnote and related content or replace the source with one that does not promote critical race theory:</p> <p>Eunice Ho, UCLA Teacher Education Program Ethnic</p>	<p>See reasons above (Preface, Line 44, Footnote 1)</p>

	<p>Au, eds. <i>Rethinking Ethnic Studies</i>. Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018.”</p>	<p>Studies Cohort, Class of 2019, summarizing the work of R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, “The Ethnic Studies Framework: A Holistic Overview,” 72-75, in Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. <i>Rethinking Ethnic Studies</i>. Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018.”</p>	
<p>Chapter 3 Lines 55-57  (Footnote 2)</p>	<p>Allyson Tintiangco-Cubales et al., "Toward an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy: Implications for K–12 Schools from the Research," <i>The Urban Review</i> 47, no. 1 (March 12, 2015).</p>	<p>Remove footnote and related content or replace the source with one that does not promote critical race theory and is based on confirmed research:</p> <p>Allyson Tintiangco-Cubales et al., "Toward an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy: Implications for K–12 Schools from the Research," <i>The Urban Review</i> 47, no. 1 (March 12, 2015).</p>	<p>1. Source promotes critical race theory.</p> <p>As an example, Tintiangco-Cubales’ paper repeatedly asserts race-based stereotypes about White teachers whose “beliefs and deficits must be confronted.” These race-based stereotypes include:</p> <p>“for White teachers especially, issues of identity involve unpacking the impact of benefiting from racism, as well as learning to recognize themselves as cultural beings”</p> <p>White teachers “often bring naive optimism that coexists with unexamined stereotypes”</p> <p>White teachers create “a hegemonic story about how people of color should be able to pick themselves up by their bootstraps’</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>

			<p>2. Does not comply with SBE’s ESMC Guidelines which require that this curriculum “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” This includes:</p> <p>The findings Tintiangco-Cubales mentions above are based on pre-2016 observations and opinions such as a 2011 findings generalized to White teachers after observing six White teachers in Chicago.</p> <p>Tintiangco-Cubales’ paper contains many similar findings from small, uncontrolled and unverified studies.</p> <p>Stanford’s Dee and Penner -- whose study just received an award and is endorsed in the curriculum --- stated that their 2016 study “is the first study to examine the effect of any type of culturally relevant pedagogy (CRP) in a quantitative study that supports credible causal inferences.” (page 24)  <a href="https://www.nber.org/system/files/working_papers/w21865/w21865.pdf">https://www.nber.org/system/files/working_papers/w21865/w21865.pdf</a></p> <p>This indicates that Tintiangco-Cubales’ conclusions are based on “findings” that Dee and Penner found deficient. As a result, this paper and content pulled from it should be removed from the ESMC.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and</p>
--	--	--	---

			comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)
Chapter 3 Lines 83-87  (Footnote 3)	Tintiangco-Cubales et al., "Toward an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy," pp. 118–120.	Remove footnote and related content or replace the source with one that does not promote critical race theory and is based on confirmed research:  Tintiangco-Cubales et al., "Toward an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy," pp. 118–120.	See reasons above (Chapter 3, Lines 55-57, Footnote 2)
Chapter 3 Line 279 Footnote 11	For More on Community/Culturally Relevant and Responsive Pedagogies see: Gloria Ladson-Billings, "Toward a Theory of Culturally Relevant Pedagogy." <i>American Educational Research Journal</i> 32, no. 3 (Autumn 1995): 465–91; R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. <i>Rethinking Ethnic Studies</i> (Williston, VT: Rethinking Schools, 2019); Bell hooks. <i>Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom</i> (New York, NY: Routledge, 1994).	Revise the footnote and related content as follows or replace the source with one that does not promote critical race theory:  For More on Community/Culturally Relevant and Responsive Pedagogies see: Gloria Ladson-Billings, "Toward a Theory of Culturally Relevant Pedagogy." <i>American Educational Research Journal</i> 32, no. 3 (Autumn 1995): 465–91; R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. <i>Rethinking Ethnic Studies</i>	See reasons above (Preface, Line 44, Footnote 1)



		(Williston, VT: Rethinking Schools, 2019); Bell hooks: <i>Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom</i> (New York, NY: Routledge, 1994).	
Chapter 3, Lines 1036-1039 and Footnote 16	<p>For example, Christine Sleeter has produced a Teaching Works article that describes a curriculum planning framework focused on ethnic studies content that is culturally responsive to the lived experience of students, and a book that elaborates on the framework and offers examples.”</p> <p>Footnote:  “Christine Sleeter, <i>Designing Lessons and Lesson Sequences with a Focus on Ethnic Studies or Culturally Responsive Curriculum</i> (University of Michigan: Teaching Works, 2017), <a href="http://www.teachingworks.org/images/files/TeachingWorks_Sleeter.pdf">http://www.teachingworks.org/images/files/TeachingWorks_Sleeter.pdf</a> (accessed June 1, 2020), and Christine Sleeter and Judith Flores Carmona, <i>Unstandardizing Curriculum: Multicultural teaching in the standards-based classroom</i> (New York: Teachers College Press, 2017).</p>	Delete this paragraph and its footnote.	<p>Christine Sleeter is a private, fee-based Ethnic Studies consultant.</p> <p>In September 2020, Sleeter asked the IQC to include her article and two new books in the ESMC:</p> <p>“Transformative Ethnic Studies in Schools.” (See #38, Sleeter request, in CDE’s November 2020 Table of Submitted Line Edits (Attachment C in IQC agenda packet). This book costs \$90 (hardcover).</p> <p>Teaching Works “that describes a curriculum planning framework ...and a book that elaborates on the framework and offers examples” citing Sleeter’s new book “Unstandardizing Curriculum: Multicultural teaching in the standards-based classroom.” (See #214, Sleeter request, in CDE’s November 2020 Table of Submitted Line Edits (Attachment C in IQC packet). This book costs \$75.48 (hardcover).</p> <p>Both books must be purchased in order to have access to the material.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b> CDE does not permit advertising in this curriculum. (“Lessons/resources should not contain any advertising or require any payment to use”. See CDE Second Field Review instructions (August 31, 2020)</p>

			See also CA Ed Code 60048 and SBE Social Content Standards, 2013: “The standards prevent unfair exposure of any privately produced product.”
Chapter 4 (throughout)		Remove all sources that promote “critical race theory.”  While many of these sources are listed in the line edits below, we request that the Bibliography be thoroughly reviewed and all sources that promote “critical race theory” be removed.	Source(s) promotes critical race theory.  Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Chapter 4 (Lines 20-21)	Bell hooks. <i>Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom</i> . New York, NY: Routledge, 1994.	Delete “Bell hooks. <i>Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom</i> . New York, NY: Routledge, 1994.”	Source promotes critical race theory.  Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Chapter 4 (Lines 26-28)	Brown, Keffrelyn, and Anthony Brown... (May 2010): 139–54”	Delete “Brown, Keffrelyn, and Anthony Brown... (May 2010): 139–54”	Source promotes critical race theory.  Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Chapter 4 (Lines 29-30)	Brown, Ruth Nicole, and Chamara Jewel Kwakye, eds. <i>Wish to Live: The Hip-Hop Feminism Pedagogy Reader</i> . New York, NY: Peter Lang, 2012.	Delete “Brown, Ruth Nicole, and Chamara Jewel Kwakye, ...2012”	Source promotes critical race theory.  Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )

Chapter 4 (Lines 42-43)	Cuauhtin, R. T., Zavala, M., Sleeter, C., & Au, W. (Eds.). (2018). Rethinking Ethnic Studies	Delete "Cuauhtin, R. T., Zavala, M., Sleeter, C., & Au, W. (Eds.). (2018). Rethinking Ethnic Studies"	See note above (Preface, Line 44, Footnote 1)
Chapter 4 (Lines 93-94)	Omi, Michael and Howard Winant (2014)	Delete "Omi, Michael and Howard Winant (2014)"	<p>1. "Master category"</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. This claim was first made by Omi and Winant in their book "Racial Formation" (3rd edition), not Tolteka Cuauhtin who asserts it in his book without attribution.</li> <li>d. Omi and Winant acknowledge that this claim parts with "both mainstream social science and left political theorizing about race." (page vii)</li> <li>e. It is based on Omi and Winant's new view that race is the primary lens to be used to explain what happens in our country, a critical race theory framing:   <i>"We advance what may seem an audacious claim. We assert that in the United States, race is a master category — a fundamental concept that has profoundly shaped, and continues to shape, the history, polity, economic structure, and culture of the United States." (page 106)</i>   <i>"This is a new claim for us....we are emphasizing its ubiquity: its presence and importance. We are noting that no other social conflict—not class, not sex/gender, not colonialism or imperialism—can ever be understood independently of it." (page viii)</i> </li> </ul> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p>

			<p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. Source promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
Chapter 4 (Lines 101-104)	Romero, Augustine...(June 2009): 217–33	Delete “Romero, Augustine...(June 2009): 217–33”	<p>Source promotes critical race theory.</p> <p>Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
Chapter 4 (Lines 117-118)	Sleeter, Christine, and Miguel Zavala, <i>Transformative Ethnic Studies in Schools</i> . New York: Teachers College Press, 2020.	Sleeter, Christine, and Miguel Zavala, <i>Transformative Ethnic Studies in Schools</i> . New York: Teachers College Press, 2020.	<p>1. Christine Sleeter is a private, fee-based Ethnic Studies consultant.</p> <p>In September 2020, Sleeter asked the IQC to include her article and two new books in the ESMC:</p> <p>“Transformative Ethnic Studies in Schools.” (See #38, Sleeter request, in CDE’s November 2020 Table of Submitted Line Edits (Attachment C in IQC agenda packet).. This book costs \$90 (hardcover).</p>

			<p>Teaching Works “that describes a curriculum planning framework ...and a book that elaborates on the framework and offers examples” citing Sleeter’s new book “Unstandardizing Curriculum: Multicultural teaching in the standards-based classroom.” (See #214, Sleeter request, in CDE’s November 2020 Table of Submitted Line Edits (Attachment C in IQC agenda packet). This book costs \$75.48 (hardcover).</p> <p>Both books must be purchased in order to have access to the material.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b> CDE does not permit advertising in this curriculum. (“Lessons/resources should not contain any advertising or require any payment to use”. See CDE Second Field Review instructions (August 31, 2020)</p> <p>See also CA Ed Code 60048 and SBE Social Content Standards, 2013: “The standards prevent unfair exposure of any privately produced product.”</p> <p>2. Source promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
Chapter 4 (Lines 123-125)	Solorzano...(2001): 308-42	Delete "Solorzano...(2001): 308-42"	<p>Source promotes critical race theory.</p> <p>Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>

Chapter 4 (Lines 134-137)	Tintiangco-Cubales ...Toward ...(March 2015: 104-25”	Delete “Tintiangco-Cubales ...Toward ...(March 2015: 104-25”	Source promotes critical race theory. See comment above (Chapter 3, Footnote 3)
Chapter 4 (Lines 138-139)	Ullucci, Kerr...(2011): 561–77	Delete “Ullucci, Kerr...(2011): 561–77”	Source promotes critical race theory. Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Chapter 4 (Lines 140-141)	Valencia... Routledge, 2010	Delete “Valencia... Routledge, 2010”	Source promotes critical race theory. Requirement: do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Appendix A lines 10608-1061 4  Footnote 30	Racial categories and boundaries can change over time and place, and a group can become racialized, that is, categorized as a stigmatized group, or be seen as part of a dominant race. <sup>[30]</sup>  <hr/> <sup>(30)</sup> See Michael Omi and Howard Winant. <i>Racial Formation in the United States</i> . 3rd Edition. New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 2014.	Remove this paragraph, footnote, and source.	1. Like critical race theory, “racial formation” is a theory (as noted by the authors in the original content) and, as such, is not fact-based. Asserting it as fact as is done in this passage misleads students into believing it accurately describes society today.  <b>Requirements:</b>  The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)  All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)  2. “Racial hierarchies” is a generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.  Promotes critical race theory.

			<b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
--	--	--	---

## Comments on Sample Lesson 26: Dr. Sammy Lee (1920–2016)

The following table lists specific comments related to Sample Lesson 26 in the ESMC Draft 3. The CDE should review this lesson carefully to remove all:

- Misused terms and words
- Anti-White bias
- Historical oversimplifications and inaccuracies

To assist the CDE, listed below are 22 excerpts from some, but not all, of the content that should be revised as indicated.

Chapter/ Appendix	Content	Request	Reason
Appendix A lines 5716-5730	Information about the author and those who assisted the author in writing the lesson.	Remove this content.	This content is unrelated to the lesson.
Appendix A lines 5747-5750 5832 5956-5957	White supremacy  White supremacist	<p>If the original content is intended to refer to racism or discrimination, then replace “white supremacy” and “white supremacist” with “racism” or “discrimination.”</p> <p>If the original content is intended to refer to ultranationalist, racist, or fascists, then add the following footnote to define the term <i>white supremacy</i> or <i>white supremacist</i>:</p> <p><b>White supremacy: The belief that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary/Lexico)</b></p> <p><b>White supremacist: A person who believes that white people constitute a superior race</b></p>	<p>1. The original content is a race-based pejorative and generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p> <p>2. “White supremacy/supremacy” is a theory and, as such, is not fact-based. Asserting it as fact as is done in this passage misleads students into believing it accurately describes society today.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p>



		<p><b>and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (<u>Oxford English Dictionary/Lexico</u>)</b></p>	<p>SBE's ESMC Guidelines require that this curriculum "include accurate information based on current and confirmed research."</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 5789-5791</p>	<p>California had long been a center for this kind of anti-Asian white supremacy since the mid-nineteenth century, so it's no wonder that Sammy Lee felt this animosity even as a child.</p>	<p>Remove this paragraph.</p>	<p>1.No source is provided for this assertion.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must "include accurate information based on current and confirmed research." (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. The original content is a race-based pejorative and generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of "white supremacy" and "white supremacist," in "Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative," above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>

<p>Appendix A lines 5816-5819</p>	<p>Even though he became popular and athletic in his teens, he was reminded in multiple ways that white people did not regard him and other people of color, including many of his friends, as “full” American citizens, perhaps not even as fully persons.<sup>[1]</sup></p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Even though he became popular and athletic in his teens, he was reminded in multiple ways that <b>some white non-Koreans</b> did not regard him and other people, including many of his friends, as “full” American citizens, perhaps not even as fully persons.<sup>[1]</sup></p>	<p>1.No source or authority is provided to support this assertion. At that time, tensions existed between Koreans and Japanese (see Takaki, R. T. (1998). <i>Strangers from a different shore: A history of Asian Americans</i>. Boston: Little, Brown., pages 363-367), Whites, and others.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2.. The original content singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 5816-5819</p> <p>Footnote 11</p>	<p>(11) The sociologists would say that Sammy Lee suffered from “internalized racism,” the ideabeing that within white supremacy, non-white persons often feel worthless, and they often wish to be white, even to pass as white. We see the impact of internalized racism in public law during this period, as when Kenneth and Mamie Clark presented their “doll studies” as</p>	<p>Revise as follows to ensure objectivity and accuracy, remove “white supremacy” and racial pejoratives and generalizations, and include citations for definitions:</p> <p>(11) <del>The</del> Some sociologists <b>may</b> would say that Sammy Lee suffered from “internalized racism,” which is defined as <b><u>the degree to which members of ethnic and racial minority groups agree with negative racist stereotypes attributed to their racial or ethnic minority groups, and consequently</u></b></p>	<p>1.No sociology authority is provided in support of this assertion. In addition, the description of “internalized racism” does not include a source.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs</p>

	<p>part of the <i>Brown</i> case in 1952; Kluger explains these studies in <i>Simple Justice</i>, in note 10, below. The idea also appears in influential pieces of literature, as in Toni Morrison, <i>The Bluest Eyes</i> (2007). Teachers may wish to review and to reference these other texts in both of the lesson plans outlined in this document.</p>	<p><del>the idea being that within white supremacy, non-white persons often feel worthless, and they often wish to be white, even to pass as white.</del> We <del>see</del> <b>saw</b> the impact of internalized racism <del>surface in the public sphere</del> in public law during this period, as when Kenneth and Mamie Clark presented their “doll studies” as part of the <i>Brown</i> case in 1952; Kluger explains these studies in <i>Simple Justice</i>, in note 10, below. The idea also appears in influential pieces of literature, as in Toni Morrison, <i>The Bluest Eyes</i> (2007). Teachers may wish to review and to reference these other texts in both of the lesson plans outlined in this document. Note that internalized racism is not unidirectional. See New York Times, <a href="#">“Rachel Dolezal’s ‘Passing’ Isn’t So Unusual.”</a></p>	<p>and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. The original content is a race-based pejorative and generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 5825-5828</p>	<p>Some Americans favored a greater role for the United States in global affairs, as an exemplar of an inclusive, liberal democracy; they felt that racial discrimination and white supremacy were harmful of American leadership toward those ends. Still other Americans preferred “American First,” a United States that would be unto itself, one that would pursue its own narrow self-interests without getting embroiled in global affairs and especially not in yet another world war.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Some Americans favored a greater role for the United States in global affairs, as an exemplar of an inclusive, liberal democracy; they felt that racial discrimination <del>and white supremacy</del> were harmful of American leadership toward those ends. Still other Americans preferred “American First,” <del>a United States that would be unto itself, one that would pursue its own narrow self-interests without getting embroiled in global affairs and especially not in yet another world war</del> an “ <b>influential political pressure group in the United States (1940–41) that opposed aid to the Allies in World War II because it feared direct American military involvement in the conflict.</b>” (<a href="#">Britannica</a>)</p>	<p>1. No source is provided for this assertion, which subjectively impugns United States’ policy intentions at that time.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. The original content contains a race-based pejorative and generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p>

			<p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 5842-5844</p>	<p>Roosevelt revealed later that he was fearful of losing support from the Southern Democrats, the so-called “Dixiecrats,” who also happened to be white supremacists.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Roosevelt revealed later that he was fearful of losing support from the Southern Democrats, the so-called “Dixiecrats,” a group of southerners <del>who also happened to be white supremacists</del> <b>who objected to the civil rights program of the Democratic party. add footnote to the source:</b> <a href="https://www.britannica.com/topic/Dixiecrat">https://www.britannica.com/topic/Dixiecrat</a>).</p>	<p>Original information is inaccurate and no source is provided for this assertion.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. The original content is a race-based pejorative and generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>

<p>Appendix A lines 5857-5858</p>	<p>These old patterns of white supremacy existed alongside new opportunities for people like Lee.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>These old patterns of <b>anti-Korean discrimination</b> <del>white supremacy</del> existed alongside new opportunities for people like Lee.</p>	<p>1.No source or authority is provided to support this assertion. At that time, tensions existed between Koreans and Japanese (see Takaki, R. T. (1998). <i>Strangers from a different shore: A history of Asian Americans</i>. Boston: Little, Brown., pages 363-367), Whites, and others.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2.. The original content singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 5932-5937</p>	<p>That American diplomats and public officials were presenting him for over a decade as an American citizen was itself a striking example of how the “American body politic” was altering, to be inclusive of Asian Americans, which, at the very least implied that the United States was no longer committed to white supremacist notions of white racial</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>That American diplomats and public officials were presenting him for over a decade as an American citizen was itself a striking example of how the “American body politic” was altering, to be inclusive of Asian Americans, which <b>indicated that progress in equal rights was being made in the United States.</b>, <del>at the very least implied that the</del></p>	<p>1.No source or authority is provided to support this assertion. At that time, tensions existed between Koreans and Japanese (see (see Takaki, R. T. (1998). <i>Strangers from a different shore: A history of Asian Americans</i>. Boston: Little, Brown., pages 363-367), Whites, and others.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p>

	<p>purity or white race-based citizenship.</p>	<p><del>United States was no longer committed to white supremacist notions of white racial purity or white race-based citizenship.</del></p>	<p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2.. The original content singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 5951-5952</p>	<p>White supremacists still held considerable political power. In 1954, when the United States Supreme Court announced its decision in <i>Brown v. Board of Education</i>, United States Senators would take to wearing simple buttons that said “NEVER” on the floor of the Senate, as in they would never comply with <i>Brown</i>.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p><del>White supremacists</del> <b>Some whites</b> still held considerable political power. <del>In 1954, when the United States Supreme Court announced its decision in <i>Brown v. Board of Education</i>, United States Senators would take to wearing simple buttons that said “NEVER” on the floor of the Senate, as in they would never comply with <i>Brown</i>.</del></p>	<p>1.No source or authority is provided to support this assertion.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2.. The original content singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p>

			<p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 6030-6032</p>	<p><b>The Essential Question</b> should be: “How did people of color, including immigrants from Asia, cope with white supremacist rules in the early twentieth century?”</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p><b>The Essential Question</b> should be: “How did <b>marginalized groups</b> people of color, including immigrants from Asia, cope with discriminatory <del>white supremacist</del> rules in the early twentieth century?”</p>	<p>1.No source or authority is provided to support this assertion (“a white supremacist political environment”). Discrimination at this time was not limited to Asian immigrants and people of color; “white” immigrants such as the Irish, Jews, Italians, and Poles were discriminated against at that time, as well.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2.. The original content singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and</i></p>

			<i>California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i>
Appendix A lines 6046-6049	<b>The Historical Thinking Learning Objective</b> should focus on these rules from the perspective of people of color. The <b>Essential Questions</b> for this lesson should be as follows: what did it feel like to live in such a white supremacist political environment if you were a family of color?	Revise as follows:  <b>The Historical Thinking Learning Objective</b> should focus on these rules from the perspective of people <b>who were marginalized and discriminated against because of their nationality or ethnicity</b> of color. The <b>Essential Questions</b> for this lesson should be as follows: what did it feel like to live in such a discriminatory <del>white supremacist</del> political environment if <b>your family was marginalized because of its ethnicity</b> <del>were a family of color</del> ?	1. No source or authority is provided to support this assertion (“a white supremacist political environment”). Discrimination at this time was not limited to people of color; “white” immigrants such as the Irish, Jews, Italians, and Poles were discriminated against at that time, as well.  <b>Requirements:</b>  The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)  All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)  2.. The original content singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.  See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.  Promotes critical race theory.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Appendix A lines 6051-6054	(In this portion of the lesson, teachers may wish to ask their students, especially the students of color, whether they <i>still</i> feel as though they are second-class citizens, and whether that might be	Revise as follows:  (In this portion of the lesson, teachers may wish to ask their students, <del>especially the students of color</del> , whether they <b>ever still</b> feel as though they are second-class citizens, and whether that might be a legacy of	Differentiating classroom discussion based on race is racial discrimination. In addition, this particular discussion presumes that all students of color at some point felt like second class citizens and that none of the white students ever experienced this feeling. This is



	<p>a legacy of white supremacist public rules and attitudes.)</p>	<p><b>discriminatory</b> white supremacist public rules and attitudes.)</p>	<p>stereotyping. Finally, grouping students by race for assignments is dividing them.</p> <p>In addition, the original content includes a race-based pejorative and generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 6064-6067</p>	<p>Students should also learn a very important lesson—that some white Americans did not embrace white supremacist attitudes and that a significant fraction of white folks were rather moving away from them.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p><del>Students should also learn a very important lesson—that some white Americans did not embrace white supremacist attitudes and that a significant fraction of white folks were rather moving away from them.</del></p> <p><b>While discriminatory public rules and attitudes existed, progress was being made and many people who formerly discriminated against marginalized groups were changing their beliefs.</b></p>	<p>1.No source or authority is provided to support this assertion.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. The original content singles out one race for opprobrium,a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>

Appendix A lines 6070-6073	Race-based segregation and white supremacy were weakening in critical ways during the course of his life, and Sammy Lee was thus “assimilating” into American citizenship through pathways that were not possible for persons of Asian ancestry in the late 19th century.	Delete the entire passage unless a reliable authority can be cited for this.	No source or authority is provided to support this assertion.  <b>Requirements:</b>  The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)  All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)
Appendix A lines 6108-6111	The communist critique was simply true: American law was openly white supremacist, it had been that way for decades, and when American diplomats were attempting to exercise American leadership, they knew that this criticism was both very true and quite devastating for American foreign policy.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Revise as follows:  The communist critique was simply true: <b>some</b> American laws <b>were</b> <del>was</del> openly <b>discriminatory</b> <del>white supremacist</del>, it had been that way for decades, and when American diplomats were attempting to exercise American leadership, they knew that this criticism was both very true and quite devastating for American foreign policy.</li> <li>● Delete this phrase or provide a source for it:  ...when American diplomats were attempting to exercise American leadership, they knew that this criticism was both very true and quite devastating for American foreign policy.</li> </ul>	<p>1.No source or authority is provided to support this assertion.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. The original content singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
Appendix A	White supremacist had long held that people of color were not only	Revise as follows:	No source or authority is provided to support this assertion. Discrimination at this time was

<p>lines 6116-6132</p>	<p>intellectually inferior but physically inferior as well—people of color were like animals, they said, and under the elaborate rules of competitive, “civilized” sports, people of color were unfit to compete. And even if they did, they were unsuited to win. So, when Jesse Owens dominated the track and field events in the 1936 Summer Olympics, white supremacists struggled to explain how they had been so wrong. Sammy Lee did not have the taller, “conventional” body of an Olympic diver—his coach, Jim Ryan, told him as much—and yet when he performed acrobat, stunning, and precise dives from the springboard and from the platform, his very performances also undermined one of the singular tenets of white supremacist thinking. White people were not, in fact, physically superior, nor did they have a monopoly on physical or athletic perfection. For many younger students now, so accustomed to seeing people of color in sports, these physical and aesthetic dimensions of white supremacy might seem especially ridiculous, and yet in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, many white supremacists pointed to these purportedly “innate” differences between “races” to justify race-based exclusions and discriminations, and to insist on the inferiority of people of color</p>	<p>White supremacist <b>(add footnote)</b> had long held that people of color <b>and other White immigrant groups</b> were not only intellectually inferior but physically inferior as well—people of color were like animals, they said, and under the elaborate rules of competitive, “civilized” sports, people of color were unfit to compete. And even if they did, they were unsuited to win. So, when Jesse Owens dominated the track and field events in the 1936 Summer Olympics, white supremacists <b>(add footnote)</b> struggled to explain how they had been so wrong. Sammy Lee did not have the taller, “conventional” body of an Olympic diver—his coach, Jim Ryan, told him as much—and yet when he performed acrobat, stunning, and precise dives from the springboard and from the platform, his very performances also undermined one of the singular tenets of white supremacist <b>(add footnote)</b> thinking. White people were not, in fact, physically superior, nor did they have a monopoly on physical or athletic perfection. For many younger students now, so accustomed to seeing people of color in sports, these physical and aesthetic dimensions of <b>white supremacists (add footnote) white supremacy</b> might seem especially ridiculous, and yet in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, many white supremacists <b>(add footnote)</b> pointed to these purportedly “innate” differences between “races” to justify race-based exclusions and discriminations, and to insist on the inferiority of people of color</p> <p>Add the following footnote to define the term <i>white supremacist</i>:</p> <p><b>The belief that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic</b></p>	<p>not limited to people of color; “white” immigrants such as the Irish, Jews, Italians, and Poles were discriminated against at that time, as well.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. The original content singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (<i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i>)</p>
----------------------------	--	---	---

		<b>groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary)</b>	
Appendix A lines 6135-6139	<b>The Essential Question</b> should be: “How did people of color, including distinguished athletes like Dr. Sammy Lee, help to reshape opinions about the United States, and how did their diplomacy help to persuade people of color throughout the world that the United States was no longer committed to white supremacist by the middle of the twentieth century?”	Revise as follows:  <b>The Essential Question</b> should be: “How did people of color, including distinguished athletes like Dr. Sammy Lee, help to reshape opinions about the United States, <del>and how did their diplomacy help to persuade people of color throughout the world that the United States was no longer committed to white supremacist by the middle of the twentieth century?”</del> ”	1.No source or authority is provided to support the assertion that the United States was committed to white supremacy..  <b>Requirements:</b>  The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)  All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)  2. The original content singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.  See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.  Promotes critical race theory.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Appendix A lines 6162-6166	He grew up facing all kinds of white supremacist slights and insults, his parents faced all manner of abuse and discrimination; and yet, after winning the Olympics, would <i>you</i> travel the world and state how wonderful the Americans were?	Revise as follows:  He grew up facing <b>racism</b> <del>all kinds of white supremacist slights and insults</del> , his parents faced all manner of abuse and discrimination; and yet, after winning the Olympics, would <i>you</i> travel the world and state how wonderful the Americans were?	The original content singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.  See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.  Promotes critical race theory.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and</i>

			<i>California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i>
Appendix A lines 6168-6169	Many white folks in his life had been rude, insulting, and racist, and still many others had been giving, supportive, and generous.	Revise as follows:  Many <b>people</b> <del>white folks</del> in his life had been rude, insulting, and racist, and still many others had been giving, supportive, and generous.	The original content singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.  See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.  Promotes critical race theory.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )
Appendix A lines 6170-6176	For white students, this portion of the lesson might involve considering what kind of white person they might have been in California before 1950. For students of color, Sammy Lee’s own admission that he “wished to be white” could become an important occasion to consider their own internalized racism, to reflect upon how racism can “teach” children of color to hate themselves. For all students, Lee’s life overall can serve as a reminder that a multiracial American citizenship remains a rather recent development, a mere fraction within the longer arc of American history.	Revise as follows: <del>For white students, this portion of the lesson might involve considering what kind of white person they might have been in California before 1950. For students of color, Sammy Lee’s own admission that he “wished to be white” could become an important occasion to consider their own internalized racism, to reflect upon how racism can “teach” children of color to hate themselves.</del> For all students, Lee’s life overall can serve as a reminder that a multiracial American citizenship remains a rather recent development, a mere fraction within the longer arc of American history.	Differentiating class work and assignments between “white students” and “students of color” is racial discrimination. Making assumptions about a family history based solely on ethnic group is stereotyping. Grouping students by race and then implying that one group’s ancestry was uniformly racist and the other not is both incorrect and divisive.  Promotes critical race theory.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. ( <i>Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines</i> )  Note that internalized racism is not unidirectional. See New York Times, <a href="#">“Rachel Dolezal’s ‘Passing’ Isn’t So Unusual.”</a>

## Comments on Sample Lesson 41: Jewish Americans: Identity, Intersectionality, and Complicating Ideas of Race

The following table lists specific comments related to Sample Lesson 41 in the ESMC Draft 3.

Within the ESMC, the terms “conditional whiteness,” “white presenting,” and “privilege” are used pejoratively to denote the white/dominant group. The implication is that all white people have “racial privilege” and thus perpetuate racism. This stereotype is in violation of state and SBE rules to not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students.

Chapter/ Appendix	Content	Request	Reason
Appendix A lines 10401-1040 4	By examining how Jews have been stigmatized as outsiders, sometimes seen as a racialized other, and sometimes have experienced conditional whiteness and privilege, the lesson will address how conceptions of race and labels change over time and place (racial formation), adding another lens to the study of race.	Revise as follows:  By examining how Jews have been stigmatized as outsiders, sometimes seen as a racialized other, <del>and sometimes have experienced conditional whiteness and privilege;</del> the lesson will address how conceptions of race and labels change over time and place (racial formation), adding another lens to the study of race.	The original content includes a race-based pejorative, along with generalizations that single out one race for opprobrium, in violation of State and SBE rules.  Promotes critical race theory.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i>
Appendix A lines 10404-1040 8	The lesson explains how the experiences of Jewish Americans include: prejudice, discrimination, antisemitism, racialization, hate crimes, Holocaust denial, and being targets of white supremacists, and how some Jews have also experienced assimilation, conditional whiteness, and privilege.	Revise as follows:  The lesson explains how the experiences of Jewish Americans include: prejudice, discrimination, antisemitism, racialization, hate crimes, Holocaust denial, and being targets of white supremacists, and how some Jews have also experienced assimilation, <del>conditional whiteness, and privilege.</del>  Add the following footnote to define the term <i>white supremacist</i> :	The original content includes a race-based pejorative, along with generalizations that single out one race for opprobrium, in violation of State and SBE rules.  Promotes critical race theory.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i>

		<b>The belief that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary)</b>	
Appendix A lines 10404-1040 8	The lesson explains how the experiences of Jewish Americans include: prejudice, discrimination, antisemitism, racialization, hate crimes, Holocaust denial, and being targets of white supremacists, and how some Jews have also experienced assimilation, conditional whiteness, and privilege	Revise as follows:  The lesson explains how the experiences of Jewish Americans include: prejudice, discrimination, antisemitism, racialization, hate crimes, Holocaust denial, and being targets of white supremacists, and how some Jews have also experienced assimilation, <del>conditional whiteness, and privilege</del> .	The original content includes a race-based pejorative, along with generalizations that single out one race for opprobrium, in violation of State and SBE rules.  Promotes critical race theory.  <b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)
Appendix A Line 10413	Key Terms and Concepts: antisemitism, conditional whiteness, identity, intersectionality,	Revise as follows:  Key Terms and Concepts: antisemitism, <del>conditional whiteness</del> , identity, intersectionality,	Term is removed from the lesson so should be removed from key terms and concepts, as well.
Appendix A Line 10421	1. identify the range of Jewish American experiences in relation to race and racial hierarchies over time, and how Jews are seen by others	Revise as follows:  1. identify the range of Jewish American experiences in relation to <b>antisemitism</b> <del>race and racial hierarchies</del> over time, and how Jews are seen by others	1. Like critical race theory, “racial hierarchies” is a theory and, as such, is not fact-based. Asserting it as fact as is done in this passage misleads students into believing it accurately describes society today.  <b>Requirements:</b>  The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and

			<p>confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. “Racial hierarchies” is a generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i></p>
Appendix A line 10508	The teacher leads a read aloud of the <b>Fact Sheet on Jewish Americans and Complicating Ideas of Race</b> , including Key Word Definitions on racialization, conditional whiteness, racial formation, and antisemitism	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>The teacher leads a read aloud of the <b>Fact Sheet on Jewish Americans and Complicating Ideas of Race</b>, including Key Word Definitions on racialization, <del>conditional whiteness</del>, racial formation, and antisemitism</p>	<p>The original content includes a race-based pejorative, along with generalizations that single out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i></p>
Appendix A Line 10510	What is a racial hierarchy?	Delete the entire passage.	<p>1. Like critical race theory, “racial hierarchies” is a theory and, as such, is not fact-based. Asserting it as fact as is done in this passage misleads students into believing it accurately describes society today.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and</p>



			<p>confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. “Racial hierarchies” is a generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 10512-10513</p>	<p>c. What is conditional whiteness?</p> <p>d. When, how, and which Jews have experienced racial privilege?</p>	<p>Delete the entire passage.</p>	<p>The original content includes a race-based pejorative, along with generalizations that single out one race for opprobrium, in violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</p>
<p>Appendix A Line 10530-10531</p>	<p>What have we learned about the changeability of racial classifications and hierarchies?</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>What have we learned about the changeability of racial classifications <del>and hierarchies?</del></p>	<p>1. Like critical race theory, “racial hierarchies” is a theory (see the line edit related to Appendix A Lines 10608-10614) and, as such, is not fact-based. Asserting it as fact as is done in this passage misleads students into believing it accurately describes society today.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and</p>

			<p>confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. “Racial hierarchies” is a generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</p>
<p>Appendix A Lines 10572-10573</p>	<p>Many Jews with light skin identify with the idea of white-presenting, which recognizes the divergence between external classifications and internal identity.</p>	<p>Delete entire passage</p>	<p>No source or authority is provided for the stereotype and generalization that “many Jews..identify with..white presenting.” This is subjective and not based on confirmed research. Asserting it as fact as is done in this passage misleads students into believing it accurately describes many Jews today.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)The original content includes a race-based pejorative, along with generalizations that single out one race for opprobrium, in violation of State and SBE rules.</p>

			<p>2. The original content is a race-based pejorative and generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See description of “white-presenting,” above.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i></p>
Appendix A lines 10604-10607	<b>conditional whiteness</b> - When a person or group can gain racial privilege by dropping ethnic markers of difference or assertions of belonging to a separate group. A person or a group can become white conditionally, on the condition of not being ethnically or religiously different, assimilating or passing as white.	Remove this paragraph.	<p>The original content includes a race-based pejorative, along with generalizations that single out one race for opprobrium, in violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i></p>
Appendix A lines 10608-10614	<b>racial formation</b> - Race is socially constructed rather than fixed, biological, or from time immemorial. The structure, or formation, of racial hierarchies vary in different times and places. <b>Racial formation theory</b> states that race is composed of ideas about race and the social structures of racial stratification in a particular time and place. Racial categories and boundaries can change over time and place, and a group can become racialized, that is, categorized as a stigmatized group, or be seen as part of a dominant race. <sup>[1]</sup>	Remove this paragraph.	<p>1. Like critical race theory, “racial formation” is a theory (as noted by the authors in the original content) and, as such, is not fact-based. Asserting it as fact as is done in this passage misleads students into believing it accurately describes society today.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p>

	<p><sup>[1]</sup> See Michael Omi and Howard Winant. <i>Racial Formation in the United States</i>. 3rd Edition. New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 2014.</p>		<p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. “Racial hierarchies” is a generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 10645-10648</p>	<p>After the full horror of the Holocaust came to light after 1945, American attitudes gradually changed toward Jews, anti-Jewish prejudice decreased, Jews were less often racialized, more frequently able to assimilate, gained conditional whiteness, and began to be considered white by American societal standards</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>After the full horror of the Holocaust came to light after 1945, American attitudes gradually changed toward Jews, <b>and</b> anti-Jewish prejudice decreased, <del>Jews were less often racialized, more frequently able to assimilate, gained conditional whiteness, and began to be considered white by American societal standards.</del> <b>However, antisemitism has risen steeply recently. In 2019, anti-Jewish hate crimes were the third most prevalent ethnic-based hate crimes in CA, and the first most prevalent religious-based hate crimes in CA. (include following footnote)</b></p> <p><b>Footnote:</b> <a href="https://data-openjustice.doj.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2020-06/Hate%20Crime%20In%20CA%202019.pdf">https://data-openjustice.doj.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2020-06/Hate%20Crime%20In%20CA%202019.pdf</a></p>	<p>The original content includes a race-based pejorative, along with generalizations that single out one race for opprobrium, in violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. (Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</p>

<p>Appendix A lines 10650-1065 1</p>	<p>Descendants of Jewish immigrants often assimilated and changed their position on the racial hierarchy from their immigrant parents, gaining racial privilege.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Descendants of Jewish immigrants often assimilated <del>and changed their position on the racial hierarchy from their immigrant parents, gaining racial privilege.</del></p>	<p>1. “Racial hierarchy” is a generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i></p> <p>2. Like critical race theory, “racial hierarchy” is a theory and, as such, is not fact-based. Asserting it as fact as is done in this passage misleads students into believing it accurately describes society today.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p>
<p>Appendix A lines 10659-1066 1</p>	<p>Light-skinned Jews simultaneously experience white privilege on the basis of their appearance and prejudice, discrimination, and systematic antisemitism on the basis of their Jewishness.</p>	<p>Remove this passage.</p>	<p>The original content includes a race-based pejorative, along with generalizations that single out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i></p>

<p>Appendix A lines 10623-1062 5</p>	<p>Prejudice against Jews and Catholics from Eastern and Southern Europe and white supremacy motivated the passing of the Johnson-Reed Immigration Act of 1924, greatly restricting Jewish immigration through 1965.</p>	<p>Revise as follows:</p> <p>Prejudice against Jews and Catholics from Eastern and Southern Europe <del>and white supremacy</del> motivated the passing of the Johnson-Reed Immigration Act of 1924, greatly restricting Jewish immigration through 1965.</p>	<p>1. The original content includes a race-based pejorative and generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i></p>
<p>Appendix A lines 10630-1063 1</p>	<p>For the first half of the twentieth century, Jews were usually not considered white in the US racial formation.</p>	<p>Delete this passage.</p>	<p>1. Like critical race theory, “racial formation” is a theory (see the line edit related to Appendix A Lines 10608-10614) and, as such, is not fact-based. Asserting it as fact as is done in this passage misleads students into believing it accurately describes society today.</p> <p><b>Requirements:</b></p> <p>The ESMC must “include accurate information based on current and confirmed research.” (SBE ESMC Guidelines)</p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>2. “Racial formation” is a generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, a violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p>

			<p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i></p>
<p>Appendix A lines 10652-10656</p>	<p>White supremacists continue to racialize Jews as non-white. This was evident when the Unite the Right March in Charlottesville chanted “The Jews will not replace us” with “us” referring to white Americans.</p>	<p>Replace with the following:</p> <p><b>Some white supremacists (add footnote 1) racialize Jews as non-white. Others, such as those at the Unite the Right rally in Charlottesville who chanted “the Jews will not replace us,” are threatened by Jews who stand up for and support minorities and immigrants; white supremacists fear these groups will take their jobs and replace them in the workforce. (add footnote 2)</b></p> <p><b>Footnote 1: A person who believes that white people constitute a superior race and should therefore dominate society, typically to the exclusion or detriment of other racial and ethnic groups, in particular black or Jewish people. (Oxford English Dictionary/Lexico)</b></p> <p><b>Footnote 2:</b>  <a href="https://www.adl.org/education/references/hate-symbols/you-will-not-replace-us">https://www.adl.org/education/references/hate-symbols/you-will-not-replace-us</a></p>	<p>1. This information is incorrect and no authority is cited. This revision ensures compliance with the following <b>requirements:</b></p> <p>All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils. (CA Education Code Section 60045)</p> <p>Do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i></p> <p>2. The original content includes a race-based pejorative and generalization that singles out one race for opprobrium, in violation of State and SBE rules.</p> <p>See definitions of “white supremacy” and “white supremacist,” in “Comments on Racial Identity/White as a Pejorative,” above.</p> <p>Promotes critical race theory.</p> <p><b>Requirement:</b> do not discriminate, demean, stereotype, or divide students. <i>(Federal and California law and State Board of Education approved Standards and Guidelines)</i></p>

